



APPROVED SUMMARIZED MINUTES

**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 17, 2015

**KIVA – CITY HALL
3939 N. DRINKWATER BOULEVARD
SCOTTSDALE, ARIZONA 85251**

CALL TO ORDER

Vice Chair Holley called the regular meeting of the Scottsdale Transportation Commission to order at 6:03 p.m.

1. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Paul Holley, Vice Chair
Gary Bretz, Commissioner
Barry Graham, Commissioner
Steven Rosenberg, Commissioner
Robert Stickles, Commissioner

ABSENT: Steven Olmsted, Chair

STAFF: Rose Arballo, Coordinator
John Bartlett, Traffic Engineer
Paul Basha, Director of Transportation
Randy Ghezzi, Street Operations Director
Phil Kercher, Principal Traffic Engineer
Andrew Merkley, Traffic Engineering Analyst

2. PUBLIC COMMENT

No members of the public wished to address the Commission.

3. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

- Study Session of the Transportation Commission – August 20, 2015
- Regular Meeting of the Transportation Commission – August 20, 2015

COMMISSIONER BRETZ MOVED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING AND STUDY SESSION OF AUGUST 20, 2015. COMMISSIONER STICKLES SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED BY A VOTE OF FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0). CHAIRMAN OLMSTED WAS ABSENT.

4. NOISE REDUCING ASPHALT

Mr. Randy Ghezzi, Street Operations Director, provided the report. Highlights of the presentation included a comparison of the merits and disadvantages of tire rubber modified emulsions, crumb rubber modified asphalt, noise reduction considerations, and challenges in using terminal blended emulsions.

Vice Chair Holley opened the floor for public comment.

- Mr. Bill Tobinski commented on changing traffic conditions on Happy Valley Road, near his home, from once relatively quiet to now busy, congested and noisy. He addressed concerns over even greater noise and activity with the property being developed on the vacant land nearby. He stressed the need for application of noise reduction material to the surface of the road, increased traffic enforcement and enforcement of the ordinance prohibiting trucks on Happy Valley Road.
- Mr. Steve Bonniwell resides in the same area and voiced similar concerns. In addition, he noted the existence of cracks in the road at approximately 10 to 20 yard intervals.

Highlights of ensuing discussion included:

- Vice Chair Holley asked about ADOT's approach, to which Mr. Ghezzi replied that ADOT is evaluating mixes for use on the 101 freeway upon its completion and that they are leaning towards a terminal blended 76/22 mix. There is a drawback, in that this calls for 8.5% emulsion rate, which is extremely high and results in flushing. This means that it deteriorates at a faster rate.
- Mr. Ghezzi clarified that for superior noise reduction, the best approach is to apply asphalt over concrete, with a 1.5 inch overlay providing 50% noise reduction.
- Mr. Ghezzi confirmed an observation from Vice Chair Holley that the City of Scottsdale utilizes concrete mainly for bridges and paths.
- In response to a question from a Commissioner, Mr. Ghezzi said that the cost to upgrade from dense graded applications is \$20 per ton for crumb rubber and \$30 per ton for terminal blended tire rubber.

5. PARADISE LANE AND 73RD STREET BIKE LANE ADDITION

Andrew Merkley, Traffic Engineering Analyst, provided the report. Highlights of the presentation included:

- Within the City, there are 134 miles of bike lanes, 121 miles of bike routes and 94 miles of paved paths.
- The City has earned the silver Bicycle Friendly Community designation from the League of American Bicyclists in 2005 and achieved the gold level in 2011.
- While many streets in the greater Airpark area provide bike lanes, there are a limited number of bicycle facilities immediately in the vicinity of the Airport.
- Imminent bike lane additions are located at Thunderbird Road between 90th Street and Frank Lloyd Wright as well as the Raintree Drive extension alignment and Redfield Road.
- Proposed bike line locations include 73rd Street between Thunderbird Road and Paradise Lane and on Paradise Lane between Scottsdale Road and Greenway Hayden Loop.
 - The 73rd Street location is currently designated as a minor collector with a 30 mile per hour speed limit and parking currently permitted along portions of the street south of Butherus Drive. Parking is prohibited north of Butherus Drive. The street is designated as a bike route and is appropriate for the addition of bike lanes due to lower volumes and speeds. In order to add bike lanes, the majority of existing striping will need to be removed and replaced with a typical two cross section layout.
 - The first typical cross section will extend between Thunderbird Road and Butherus Drive, consisting of two 11-foot thru lanes, an 11-foot center two-way left turn lane and six-foot bike lanes.
 - The second typical cross section extends between Butherus Drive and Paradise Lane, consisting of two ten-foot thru lanes, a nine-foot center two-way left turn lane and two four-foot bike lanes.
 - Once bike lanes are added to 73rd Street and Paradise line, future considerations include evaluating speed limits.
 - Hayden Road and Greenway Hayden Loop in the vicinity of the Airpark will be evaluated for the addition of bike lanes.
 - The Paradise Lane location between Scottsdale Road and the Greenway Hayden Loop is a minor collector with a 35 mile per hour speed limit. Parking is currently prohibited along the entire segment and is designated as a bike route. It is an appropriate candidate for the addition of bike lanes, as the alternative route on Frank Lloyd Wright has much higher volumes and speeds. In order to add bike lanes, the majority of the existing striping can be preserved as is, resulting in lower project costs.
 - The typical cross section, that will extend between Scottsdale Road and Greenway Hayden Loop will consist of 9 ½-foot thru lanes, 4-foot bike lanes and the existing 10 to 10 ½-foot center two-way left-turn lane.
 - Public outreach has been conducted for this addition with no objections received thus far. However, property owners have expressed concerns regarding car haulers using the two-way left-turn lane on Paradise Lane as a parking staging area before entering the dealerships to the north. Residents are also concerned about speeding along Paradise Lane.
 - The addition of bike lanes will reduce the thru lane width on Paradise Lane, which tends to result in lower traveling vehicle speeds.
 - Prior to public outreach efforts, staff was contacted by a property owner near the intersection of the Greenway Hayden Loop and Paradise Lane, requesting

that the operation of the intersection be reviewed. Although Traffic Engineering staff conducted a signal warrant study and concluded that a signal is not warranted, recommendations were made to improve the operation of the intersection.

- The east/west approaches to the intersection on Paradise Lane provide three lanes, including a dedicated left turn lane, thru lane, and dedicated right turn lane. It is recommended that these approaches be restriped to provide two lanes, including a shared thru/left turn lane and a dedicated right turn lane. This will reduce complexity of the intersection.
- It is recommended that southbound U-turns be restricted. In lieu of this, it is recommended that a turn lane approximately 400 feet south of Paradise Lane be installed.
- Vegetation at the intersection has been removed to improve visibility and sight distance considerations.
- To increase bicycle connectivity in the Airpark, the planned path connections will continue to be implemented.

Highlights of ensuing discussion included:

- In response to an inquiry from Vice Chair Holley, Mr. Merkley clarified that the proposed left turn lane south of Paradise Lane would provide southbound U-turning vehicles with better visibility of northbound traffic and will reduce the amount of turning conflicts at Paradise Lane.
- A Commissioner expressed concern over the proposed reduction in width of the thru lane on Paradise Lane to 9.5 feet. Mr. Merkley and Mr. Phillip Kercher addressed the commissioner's concern.
- A Commissioner expressed concern on the reduction of east/west approaches at Paradise Lane and the Greenway/Hayden Loop.

COMMISSIONER GRAHAM MOVED TO ACCEPT STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION TO ADD BIKE LANES ON 73RD STREET AND PARADISE LANE AS PROPOSED. COMMISSIONER STICKLES SECONDED. THE MOTION CARRIED BY A VOTE OF FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0).

6. NEIGHBORHOOD TRAFFIC MANAGEMENT PROGRAM (NTMP)

Mr. John Bartlett, Traffic Engineer, provided an overview of the Neighborhood Traffic Management Program process.

Mr. Bartlett also reviewed completed projects at Granite Reef Road between Osborn Road and Thomas Road and 86th Street between Earll Drive and Thomas Road. He indicated that speeds were reduced in all speed categories for both projects.

Relative to funding, the NTMP program currently has approximately \$155,000 in available funds. Approved projects to be constructed have a total estimated cost of \$283,000. These include Cattletrack Road, between Lincoln Drive and McDonald Drive and Cholla Street between Hayden Road and 84th Street. The Cattletrack Road project consists of two center median islands and a chicane. The Cholla Street project consists of two sets of side islands and one center median island.

Staff is currently working with Public Works to submit a request to City Council to reallocate available funds to make up the deficit needed for construction of these two projects. Mr. Bartlett added that the program will receive \$100,000 of funding for 2016 as part of the five-year capital improvement program.

Mr. Bartlett provided an update on the Cholla Street Project. Highlights of the presentation included:

- The Cholla Street project is located on Cholla Street north of Shea Boulevard between Hayden Road and 84th Street.
 - Residents completed the Speed Awareness phase in September, 2012.
 - Public meetings were held in January and April, 2013.
 - Residents completed the petition process in April, 2014.
 - The Commission approved the project in May, 2014 with an estimated cost of \$85,000.
 - The project consists of one center median island and two sets of side median islands located at the east and west ends of the project.
 - During the design phase, two concerns were raised by the Street Operations Department.
 - The original concept provided drainage behind the median islands. This posed a maintenance concern for street operations, as debris can become lodged and constrict water flow. Street sweepers do not reach the narrow area behind the median islands. To mitigate the problem, the side median islands were tied into the existing curb, allowing the water to flow in front. A small portion of the asphalt on both side median islands was regraded to maintain consistent drainage.
 - The second concern was the narrow 10-foot roadway section at the center median island, as current maintenance contracts do not allow overlay of pavement widths less than 12 feet. Asphalt will be replaced in an area around the center median island to increase the life of the asphalt as well as provide sufficient time for Street Operations to incorporate narrower roadway maintenance into their future maintenance contracts.
 - The costs of resolving these two issues, combined with the fees for the outside consultant have revised the total project cost to \$114,800.
- Vice Chair Holley reminded Commissioners that both the Cholla Street and Cattletrack projects had been presented and approved by the Commission previously and that the only change is the increase in project costs.
- A Commissioner commented that the revised budget represents a 34 percent increase in costs. Mr. Bartlett explained that the design team was experiencing a backlog of projects and with the Cholla Street Project unacceptably delayed, staff hired an outside consultant to perform the design. In response to an additional question from the Commissioner, Mr. Kercher replied that there is no set percentage increase that requires staff to notify the Commission; however, staff does report significant increases on a judgment basis. The Commissioner suggested the possibility of implementing a threshold percentage that would require staff to bring the funding request back for reconsideration. Mr. Bartlett acknowledged the importance of examining significant

overrides to identify issues for improvement. Mr. Kercher added that the hiring process is underway to add a third design engineer to staff.

- A Commissioner explained that the overage was unforeseen and that technically the total amount was just an estimate provided to the Commission.

Mr. Bartlett provided an update on the Cattletrack NTMP project. Highlights of the presentation included:

- The Project is located on Cattletrack Road between Lincoln Drive and McDonald Drive. It is a two-lane facility with a posted speed limit of 25 miles per hour.
 - Residents completed the Speed Awareness phase in February of 2014.
 - Residents requested an exception into the NTMP program, which was approved by the Commission in April, 2014.
 - A public meeting was held in October of 2014.
 - Neighbors finished the petition process in November of 2014.
 - The project consists of two center media islands located at the north and south ends of the project with one set of side median islands with a narrow center median.
 - The project was approved by the Commission in November of 2014. At that meeting, it was discussed that an external design consult would be hired in order to address a main concern of the residents, which was maintaining the rural character of the area throughout design and implementation.
 - The estimated construction cost was \$115,000. Items that have contributed to the additional cost include the external consultant design fee, the implementation of a chicane element and costs for design materials, such as colored concrete as well as increased landscaping costs. The revised project estimate is \$182,700.

Highlights of ensuing discussion included:

- Mr. Bartlett clarified that the consultant fee was not included in the original estimate; however, it was anticipated for the project at a total cost of \$34,500.
- A Commissioner inquired as to the decision process in hiring an outside consultant. Mr. Bartlett explained that the design portion came as a result of resident requests to maintain the rural character of the area. The design consultant had both engineering and landscape architects on staff. A Commissioner commented that the increased costs were not unreasonable.

Public comment received as follows:

- Ms. Louise Lamb requested to speak and expressed confusion regarding the need for outside consultants. Mr. Kercher replied that when there is a backlog of projects or when a project is sufficiently complex, staff may choose to hire an outside consultant. Mr. Basha added that this project was highly contentious with many varying opinions. The design complexity warranted the hiring of an outside consultant with expertise and that the choice to do so is relatively rare.
- A Commissioner suggested that staff consider adding a cost milestone element to a project's progress in order to provide the Commission with updates prior to construction.

COMMISSIONER BRETZ MOVED FOR STAFF TO MOVE FORWARD WITH OBTAINING THE NECESSARY ADDITIONAL CIP FUNDING FOR COMPLETION OF THE CHOLLA STREET AND CATTLETRACK NTMP PROJECTS. COMMISSIONER STICKLES SECONDED. THE MOTION PASSED FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0).

7. TRANSPORTATION MASTER PLAN UPDATE

Paul Basha, Director of Transportation, provided the presentation. Highlights of the presentation included:

- Discussions of the Transportation Master Plan with the Commission began in February, 2015 and is expected to continue thru December, 2015. Members of the public are encouraged to attend. It is anticipated that in December, the Commission will provide a final recommendation to the City Council.
- A computerized model prepared and utilized by the Maricopa Association of Governments (MAG) is used to assist in predicting future traffic volumes. Staff uses this generalized information as a base and expands it with more locally relevant detail.
- Staff engages an on-call planning and studies consultant who possesses particular expertise in the MAG model as well as with transportation prediction models nationwide. The consultant is used for advice only.
- Mr. Basha reviewed traffic volume statistics in detail. East/west volumes appear to be relatively accurate. The north/south volumes are either higher or lower than expected.
 - Volumes along McDowell Road are based on existing and planned occupancies. Volumes on Thomas Road are in accordance with expectations.
 - The model predicts volumes of 32,000 to 36,000 vehicles per day on Indian School Road; however, current volumes approach 40,000 vehicles per day.
 - Volumes on Camelback Road are at 34,000 vehicles per day. This is an increase from the volumes in 2014.
 - The 24,000 volume on Chaparral Road between Hayden and Pima is relatively consistent.
 - For the location of Chaparral Road between Scottsdale Road and Hayden, the volume of 11,000 vehicles per day is quite low, with the actual volume at approximately 18,000.
 - Volumes on McDowell and Indian Bend Roads are valid relative to existing volumes.
 - On Scottsdale Road south of downtown, existing volumes exceed the predicted volume of 20,000 to 35,000 vehicles per day.
 - On Drinkwater Boulevard, the 23,000 volume is nearly twice as high as existing volumes.
 - The 8,000 volumes for Goldwater Boulevard is approximately half of actual volumes.
 - On Scottsdale Road north of downtown, the 40,000 volume is consistent with actual volumes.
 - On Hayden Road, the volumes vary from 23,000 to 37,000 and are relatively consistent.
 - There is an increase on Pima Road volumes from south at McDowell Road to north at Indian Bend Road, which is expected and will continue to increase as the Salt

River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community continues development along the Pima Road Corridor.

- Between Indian Bend Road and Pinnacle Peak Road, northbound Scottsdale Road shows very high volumes in certain segments. Hayden Road reflects relatively low volumes.
- The segment of 94th Street and Thompson Peak Parkway is lower than anticipated.
- Shea Boulevard volumes are higher than actual.
- The vicinity of the Airpark reflects lower volumes than anticipated in the future.
- The same is true for Thompson Peak Parkway and the vacant land owned by the Arizona State Land Department. Proposal for development of this land is anticipated in the next year or two.
- The highest volume predicted in the City of Scottsdale for the year 2035 occurs on Shea Boulevard immediately east of the Pima Freeway interchange. This is predicted to host 72,000 traveling vehicles per day. This requires nine motor vehicle lanes. Volumes on Shea Boulevard from the freeway to the east border stay above 50,000 vehicles per day, which requires eight traffic lanes. These high volumes on Shea Boulevard are not unexpected and prompt the need to develop excellent bus and trolley systems.
- Volumes on Cactus Road reflect valid amounts.
- Frank Lloyd Wright volumes reflect a high of 49,000 vehicles and is relatively accurate. Low volumes are approximately 34,000 for much of its length. These volumes would require six lanes of traffic.
- There are high volumes on Scottsdale Road in the vicinity of the freeway, requiring eight lanes of traffic.
- Pima Road would require eight lanes between Thompson Peak Parkway and Pinnacle Peak Road.
- The 20,000 to 35,000 projections for Dynamite Boulevard are less than expected, however volumes decrease substantially moving east. These are believed to be accurate.
- Scottsdale Road volumes remain relatively high up to Dynamite Boulevard with Pima Road volumes remaining high only to Happy Valley Road.
- Staff will examine the land use data and the transportation network and will either revise stated volumes or confirm the accuracy of existing numbers.
- Mr. Basha reviewed traffic lane requirements to accommodate anticipated volumes.
- In the southern part of the City, McDowell Road requires four lanes,; however this assumes that properties in the area are vacant. Staff will be recommending that McDowell Road stay at its current six-lane configuration.
- Thomas Road calls for four lanes, which is consistent with requirements.
- Indian School Road has four lane and six-lane sections with future volumes requiring six lanes.
- For north/south streets, Scottsdale Road and Hayden Road are both six lanes for their entire length between McKellips and Indian Bend, though initial predicted volumes for 2035 show only a need for four lanes on portions of Scottsdale and Hayden. Staff recommends they remain as six lanes.
- Some sections of Scottsdale Road in the vicinity of the 101 Freeway require eight lanes. At Frank Lloyd Wright and the freeway, the initial estimates call for eight lanes. This configuration is considered unacceptable.

- Shea Boulevard would be eight lanes from the freeway to the eastern border with Fountain Hills, again being unacceptable. The volume predictions are likely valid.
- The segment of Pima Road just south of Pinnacle Peak Road indicates a possible requirement for eight lanes. Currently Pinnacle Peak Road is planned to be four lanes from Scottsdale to Pima Roads.
- Dynamite Boulevard shows four lanes for much of the length, with two lanes in certain segments. Staff recommends a consistent width from the western border to 118th Street at two lanes per direction. Staff further anticipates a recommendation that Dynamite be one lane per direction east of 116th Street. The predicted 2035 volumes are 18,000 vehicles per day. Typical maximum capacity of a one lane per direction street is 16,000 vehicles per day. However, with appropriate access control eliminating driveways and minimizing the number of intersecting streets, staff believes they can accommodate 18,000 vehicles per day.

Public comment received was as follows:

Ms. Patty Badenoch inquired about volume projections for the area of Scottsdale Road and Indian Bend with the proposed construction of a Ritz Carlton. Mr. Basha explained that the proposed development lies within the Town of Paradise Valley and the City of Scottsdale. The project extends from Lincoln Drive on the south to Indian Bend Road on the north and is west of Scottsdale Road. The Town of Paradise Valley has hired a consultant who has completed a traffic impact analysis. Staff has reviewed the analysis and confirms that higher densities of traffic will be experienced on the Scottsdale side with lower densities in Paradise Valley.

Highlights of ensuing discussion included:

- In response to a question from Vice Chair Holley, Mr. Basha stated that staff anticipates that refined estimates will be reported at the Commission meeting on November 5th.
- A Commissioner asked why eight lanes is unacceptable, especially at Shea Boulevard. Mr. Basha explained that four-lane arterial streets are barriers in a community, dividing it and making crossing difficult. This is in contrast to the livable community attributes of Scottsdale. Additional motor vehicle lanes detract from quality of life. Additionally, an eight-lane facility is not as efficient as a six-lane facility and has a higher potential for collisions. Currently, there is minimal bus service on Shea Boulevard and no bus service in the vicinity. The lane number estimates accentuate the need for a robust bus and trolley system in this portion of the City. During the May, 2015 Commission meeting, staff recommended that the Transportation Master Plan include increased frequency of existing bus service on both Shea and Hayden.
- A Commissioner commented that in 20 years, there will probably be self-driving vehicles, with six-lane roads providing more than adequate capacity.
- A Commissioner stated that eight lanes of traffic is out of character for Scottsdale and that there should be a focus on high capacity transit.
- Vice Chair Holley referred to the area of McDowell Road east of Hayden Road, expressing surprise that volumes were higher than west of Hayden. Mr. Basha replied that between Hayden and Pima Roads, McDowell Road is built out and the model assumes that General Dynamics will be fully occupied. In addition, McDowell Road between Scottsdale and Hayden is quite underutilized.

- Vice Chair Holley asked for confirmation that Pima Road would eventually be extended south to McKellips. Mr. Basha acknowledged discussions regarding extending Pima Road south of McDowell Road that would serve parts of the Salt River Pima Maricopa Indian Community on the east side of Pima Road. However, there are no definitive plans to extend Pima Road south of McKellips Road. Vice Chair Holley suggested this be identified as an item for future resolution.
- Vice Chair Holley queried the volumes on 94th Street and Thompson Peak Parkway, noting that volumes are 48,000 northbound and 17,000 southbound. Mr. Basha agreed that these numbers are inconsistent and will be refined. The volumes are high because Thompson Peak is one of the few crossings of the Central Arizona Project Canal.
- A Commissioner suggested that staff utilize the 2035 predicted population of Scottsdale as a factor in its planning. Mr. Basha agreed, but commented that traffic volume is not the result of increased population in Scottsdale as much as they are increased population in surrounding communities.

8. PATHS & TRAILS SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

Commissioner Robert Stickles provided a brief summary of the September 1, 2015 Paths & Trails Subcommittee meeting. Highlights of the report included:

- Representatives from the City of Mesa shared information on their bicycle and pedestrian program.
 - Their bike master plan dates from 2012.
 - The City of Mesa uses the League of American Bicyclist's Five Es for evaluating a city's bike program (Engineering, Education, Enforcement, Encouragement & Events and Planning), which is very similar to the criteria used by the City of Scottsdale.
 - Mesa's Bike Share Program will target locations where needs are identified.
 - Other programs include Bike to Work Day and International Walk to School Day.
 - Mesa publishes its own magazine, "Bike Life in Mesa, Who would have Known?"
 - Mesa utilizes an eco counter system to track bicycle and pedestrian traffic on multi-use paths.
- Representatives from the Maricopa Trail Foundation were present to provide an update.
 - The panel of representatives discussed an equine therapy program for veterans.
 - It is suggested that a gap analysis be conducted for equestrian trails.
 - There was discussion to provide more equestrian access to the preserve without trailering a horse. Recommendations included developing a main trail east/west and feed north/south from Dynamite Road.
 - Another suggestion was to institute a comprehensive trail maintenance program, including re-establishing trails before turning them back to the HOAs.
 - The panel also recommended providing mounting blocks for disabled riders at equine connection points.

9. OTHER TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS AND PROGRAM STATUS

Mr. Basha provided the update. Highlights of the presentation included:

- The Thomas Road streetscape project has been completed. There is an issue with the pedestrian lighting being too bright. Staff will adjust the level. Highly directional lights were installed.
- During the previous Commission meeting on September 3, 2015, a member of the public living in the vicinity of 84th Street and Black Mountain Road expressed concern about activity at the intersection. Mr. Kercher indicated that staff will address this issue by posting the intersection as a four-way stop. This is necessary due to rock outcroppings in the northwest corner of the intersection.

10. PUBLIC COMMENT

No public comment was received.

11. COMMISSION IDENTIFICATION OF FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

A Commissioner suggested that the Commission welcome presentations from two organizations, including DUET, a non-profit organization providing transportation and additional services to seniors and people with disabilities, as well as Foothills Caring Corps.

A Commissioner requested that the topic of cost controls be added to a future agenda.

12. ADJOURNMENT

With no further business to conduct, Vice Chair Holley adjourned the regular meeting at 8:36 p.m.

SUBMITTED BY:

A/V Tronics, Inc. DBA AVTranz.

***Note: These are summary action meeting minutes only. A complete copy of the audio/video recording is available at <http://www.scottsdaleaz.gov/boards/transp.asp>**